Teaching Innovations, Volume 38, Issue 1, pp. 14–26 DOI: 10.5937/inovacije2501014M



Seth-Aaron Martinez¹ Sumaya Ali <u>Karyna Mangusheva</u> Boise State University, College of Education, Boise, Idaho, USA

Original scientific paper

Paper received: Jan 17 2025 Paper accepted: Feb 14 2025 Article Published: Apr 15 2025

Expertise in the Workplace: The Lifelong Pursuit of Eminence in Professional Practice

Extended summary

This extended summary depicts the primary goal of our article, the significance and context of the problem, a precise description of the methodological approach, the most significant results and conclusions, and we close offering several pedagogical implications.

Goal of the Article

The extant literatures highlight that the path to eminence in a domain is characterized by a combination of the ability to overcome adversity (i.e. resilience and grit), extensive and deliberate practice, psychosocial skill development, and an amount of innate talent.

Significance of the Problem

Achieving eminent status is rare and is, therefore, under-researched compared to the scholarship for the expertise levels of novice, competent, and expert. Researching eminence presents a host of challenges, primarily due to the subjective nature of the concept and the varying criteria used to define and evaluate it. Eminence is often defined by a combination of quantitative measures, such as citation counts and awards, and qualitative factors, such as impact and influence within a discipline, which creates difficulties in establishing consistent metrics across fields. Hence, this inconsistency in determining what constitutes 'eminence' renders comparative analysis complex and often inadequate.

One significant issue that complicates the study of eminence is the reliance on historical data and their interpretation. Historical analyses of eminent individuals often reveal biases in what types of achievement are recognized and celebrated. This limitation not only affects the

1 SethAMartinez@boisestate.edu;

http://orcid.org/0000-0002-0583-3744

This is an open access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (CC BY 4.0) (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original paper is accurately cited.

Copyright © 2025 by the publisher Faculty of Education, University of Belgrade, SERBIA.

generalizability of the findings but also reinforces existing hierarchies and undervalues contributions from diverse cultural backgrounds. Therefore, while eminent status might suggest recognition from peers, the true influence and achievements may be obscured or entirely negated in studies relying solely on conventional metrics.

Conceptual Approach

We integrate the literatures of psychology, adult learning, and neuroscience to set forth the principles for achieving professional eminence in workplace settings. Our synthesis is the result of a literature review that explored expertise development. Our review included the topics: expertise, skill development, talent development.

Pedagogical & Training Implications

Training for eminence requires a multifaceted approach that integrates talent development, psychometric assessments, proactive educational practices, and the cultivation of psychosocial skills. Eminence requires not only innate talent but also a strategic framework for development throughout an individual's life. A central theme in achieving eminence is the recognition of distinct phases in the development of talent. To train for eminence, one must move beyond mere participation and expertise. It necessitates stages of rigorous practice and sustained engagement within one's field, which in turn fosters innovative contributions that can greatly benefit society.

In conclusion, training for eminence involves an integrated strategy that encompasses skill development, resource utilization, and the cultivation of psychosocial competencies. By fostering environments focused on continuous growth and innovation, while also emphasizing personal characteristics and educational capital, individuals can position themselves on pathways leading toward eminence.

Keywords: expertise, eminence, human resource development, talent development

References

- Albert, R. S. (1990). Real-world creativity and eminence: An enduring relationship. *Creativity Research Journal*, 3(1), 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1080/10400419009534329
- Allen, T. D., Eby, L. T., Poteet, M. L., Lentz, E., & Lima, L. (2004). Career benefits associated with mentoring for proteges: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 89(1), 127–136. https://doi.org/10.1037/0021-9010.89.1.127
- Baker, J., Schorer, J., Lemez, S., & Wattie, N. (2019). Understanding high achievement: The case for eminence. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *10*, Article 1927. https://doi.org/10.3389/fp-syg.2019.01927
- Baker, J., Wilson, S., Johnston, K., Dehghansai, N., Koenigsberg, A., De Vegt, S., & Wattie, N. (2020). Talent research in sport 1990–2018: A scoping review. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 11, Article 571. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2020.607710
- Barnett, B. G. (1995). Developing reflection and expertise: Can mentors make the difference? *Journal of Educational Administration*, 33(5), 45–59. https://doi.org/10.1108/09578239510101633

- Bjork, R. A., & Bjork, E. L. (2011). Making things hard on yourself, but in a good way: Creating desirable difficulties to enhance learning. In M. A. Gernsbacher, R. W. Pew, L. M. Hough, & J. R. Pomerantz (Eds.). *Psychology and the real world: Essays illustrating fundamental contributions to society* (pp. 56–64). Worth Publishers.
- Brookhart, S. M. (2017). *How to give effective feedback to your students*. ASCD.
- Chaiyachati, K. H., Liao, J. M., Weissman, G. E., Hubbard, R. A., Morgan, A. U., Buehler, A., & Armstrong, K. A. (2019). Gender differences in retention and promotion among generalists who graduated from research-intensive fellowships. *Journal of Graduate Medical Education*, *11*(5), 535–542. https://doi.org/10.4300/JGME-D-19-00336.1
- Chi, M. T. H. (2006). Two approaches to the study of experts' characteristics. In K. A. Ericsson, N. Charness, P. J. Feltovich, & R. R. Hoffman (Eds.), *The Cambridge handbook of expertise and expert performance* (pp. 21–30). Cambridge University Press.
- Cho, H., & Kim, B. (2022). Effect of nurses' grit on nursing job performance and the double mediating effect of job satisfaction and organizational commitment. *Healthcare*, *10*(2), Article 396. https://doi.org/10.3390/healthcare10020396
- Choudhry, N. K., Fletcher, R. H., & Soumerai, S. B. (2005). Systematic review: The relationship between clinical experience and quality of health care. *Annals of Internal Medicine*, *142*(4), 260–273. https://doi.org/10.7326/0003-4819-142-4-200502150-00008
- Connor, J., Renshaw, I., & Farrow, D. (2020). Defining cricket batting expertise from the perspective of elite coaches. *PLoS ONE*, *15*(6), Article e0234802. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal. pone.0234802
- Davids, K., & Araújo, D. (2019). Innate talent in sport: Beware of an organismic asymmetry Comment on Baker & Wattie. *Current Issues in Sport Science* (CISS), *4*, 102. https://doi.org/10.15203/CISS_2019.102
- Doane, S. M., Pellegrino, J. W., & Klatzky, R. L. (1989, January). Unix system mental models and Unix system expertise. In *Proceedings of the Twenty-Second Annual Hawaii International Conference on System Sciences. Volume II: Software Track* (pp. 457–458). IEEE Computer Society. https://doi.ieeecomputersociety.org/10.1109/HICSS.1989.48027
- Duckworth, A. (2016). Grit: The power of passion and perseverance. Scribner.
- Duckworth, A. L., Peterson, C., Matthews, M. D., & Kelly, D. R. (2007). Grit: Perseverance and passion for long-term goals. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, *92*(6), 1087–1101. https://doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.92.6.1087
- Dweck, C. S. (2006). Mindset: The new psychology of success. Random House.
- Dweck, C. S. (2012). *Self-theories: Their role in motivation, personality, and development* (2nd ed.). Psychology Press.
- Eagly, A. H., & Miller, D. I. (2016). Scientific eminence: Where are the women? *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, *11*(6), 899–904. https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691616663918
- Ericsson, A. (2016). Peak: Secrets from the new science of expertise. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.

- Ericsson, K. A., & Faivre, I. A. (1988). What's exceptional about exceptional abilities? In L. K. Obler, & D. Fein (Eds.). *The exceptional brain: Neuropsychology of talent and special abilities* (pp. 436–473). The Guilford Press.
- Ericsson, K. A., Krampe, R. T., & Tesch-Römer, C. (1993). The role of deliberate practice in the acquisition of expert performance. *Psychological Review*, *100*(3), 363–406. https://doi. org/10.1037/0033-295X.100.3.363
- Grape, C., Sandgren, M., Hansson, L. O., Ericson, M., & Theorell, T. (2002). Does singing promote well-being? An empirical study of professional and amateur singers during a singing lesson. *Integrative Physiological & Behavioral Science*, 38, 65–74. https://doi.org/10.1007/ BF02734261
- Gupta, A. (2025). Transitioning from teaching to mentoring in medical sciences. *Indian Journal of Radiology and Imaging*, 35(S 01), S155–S162. https://doi.org/10.1055/s-0044-1791746
- Hambrick, D. Z., Burgoyne, A. P., Macnamara, B. N., & Ullén, F. (2018). Toward a multifactorial model of expertise: Beyond born versus made. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 1423(1), 284–295. https://doi.org/10.1111/nyas.13586
- Johnson, S. D. (1988). Cognitive analysis of expert and novice troubleshooting performance. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, 1(3), 38–54. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1937-8327.1988. tb00021.x
- Jonassen, D. H., & Henning, P. (1999). Mental models: Knowledge in the head and knowledge in the world. *Educational Technology*, *39*(1), 37–42. https://www.jstor.org/stable/44428530
- Kaufman, J. C., & Beghetto, R. A. (2009). Beyond big and little: The four C model of creativity. *Review of General Psychology*, *13*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/10.1037/a0013688
- Kawabata, M. (2007). Virtuosity, the violin, the devil... What really made Paganini "demonic"? *Current Musicology*, 83, 85–108.
- Kulasegaram, K. M., Grierson, L. E., & Norman, G. R. (2013). The roles of deliberate practice and innate ability in developing expertise: Evidence and implications. *Medical Education*, 47(10), 979–989. https://doi.org/10.1111/medu.12260
- Lam, K. K. L., & Zhou, M. (2019). Examining the relationship between grit and academic achievement within K-12 and higher education: A systematic review. *Psychology in the Schools*, 56(10), 1654–1686. https://doi.org/10.1002/pits.22302
- Lascu, A., Spratford, W., Pyne, D. B., & Etxebarria, N. (2021). Talent development in women's cricket: Perceptions and practices of elite players and coaches. *International Journal of Sports Science & Coaching*, *16*(4), 900–912. https://doi.org/10.1177/17479541211012943
- Lechner, C. M., Danner, D., & Rammstedt, B. (2019). Grit (effortful persistence) can be measured with a short scale, shows little variation across socio-demographic subgroups, and is associated with career success and career engagement. *PLoS ONE*, *14*(11), Article e0224814. https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0224814
- Lehmann, A. C., & Ericsson, K. A. (1998). The historical development of domains of expertise: Performance standards and innovations in music. In *Genius and the mind* (pp. 67–94). Psychology Press.

- Lesgold, A., Glaser, R., Rubinson, H., Feltovich, P., Klopfer, D., & Wang, Y. (2014). Expertise in a complex skill: Diagnosing X-ray pictures. In *The nature of expertise* (pp. 311–342). Psychology Press.
- Ma, Y., Mukherjee, S., & Uzzi, B. (2020). Mentorship and protégé success in STEM fields. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *117*(25), 14077–14083. https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1915516117
- Martinez, S. A. (2023). Principles of adult learning. [Unpublished manuscript].
- Martinez, S. A., Ali, S., Mangusheva, K., & Archer, L. (2025). How can designers support strong leadership qualities? In R. E. West, T. J. Kopcha, J. E. Stefaniak, & V. P. Dennen (Eds.). *Psychology of Design* (1st Ed.) (pp. 82–98) EdTech Books. https://edtechbooks.org/pdf/827/19521
- Mitchell, T. R., Dacin, M. T., & Barling, J. (1994). The role of self-efficacy in learning and development. In J. M. Hunsaker (Ed.). *The handbook of organizational behavior* (pp. 302–320). Jossey-Bass.
- Mumford, M. D., Hester, K. S., Robledo, I. C., Peterson, D. R., Day, E. A., Hougen, D. F., & Barrett, J. D. (2012). Mental models and creative problem-solving: The relationship of objective and subjective model attributes. *Creativity Research Journal*, *24*(4), 311–330. https://doi.org/1 0.1080/10400419.2012.730008
- Mukherjee, A., Rojas, E. M., & Winn, W. D. (2005). Exploring mental models of construction managers. In *Construction Research Congress 2005: Broadening Perspectives* (pp. 1–9).
- Musso, M. W., Tatum, D., Hamer, D., Hammarlund, R., Son, L. S., & McMahon, P. M. (2019). The relationship between grit and resilience in emergency medical service personnel. *Ochsner Journal*, *19*(3), 199–203. https://doi.org/10.31486/toj.18.0144
- Olszewski-Kubilius, P., Lee, S. Y., & Batey, M. (2016a). The development of expertise in gifted children and adolescents. In K. A. Ericsson, R. Krampe, & C. Tesch-Römer (Eds.). *The Cambridge handbook of expertise and expert performance* (pp. 324–343). Cambridge University Press.
- Olszewski-Kubilius, P., Subotnik, R. F., & Worrell, F. C. (2016b). Aiming talent development toward creative eminence in the 21st century. *Roeper Review*, *38*(3), 140–152. https://doi.org/1 0.1080/02783193.2016.1184497
- Pusic, M., Pecaric, M., & Boutis, K. (2011). How much practice is enough? Using learning curves to assess the deliberate practice of radiograph interpretation. *Academic Medicine*, *86*(6), 731–736. https://doi.org/0.1097/ACM.0b013e3182178c3c
- Rogova, A., Martinez Leal, I., Britton, M., Chang, S., Escoto, K. H., Solari Williams, K. D., & Reitzel, L. R. (2022). Promoting cancer health equity: A qualitative study of mentee and mentor perspectives of a training program for underrepresented scholars in cancer health disparities. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, *19*(12), Article 7512. https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19127512
- Salas, E., & Rosen, M. A. (2009). Expertise, expertise development, and expert performance in teams. *Current Directions in Psychological Science*, *18*(6), 1–5. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8721.2009.01687.x

- Simonton, D. K. (2007). Talent and expertise: The empirical evidence for genetic endowment. *High Ability Studies*, *18*(1), 83–84. https://doi.org/10.1080/13598130701350890
- Staff, T., Gobet, F., & Parton, A. (2021). Early specialization and critical periods in acquiring expertise: A comparison of traditional versus detection talent identification in Team GB cycling at London 2012. *Journal of Motor Learning and Development*, 9(2), 296–312. https://doi.org/10.1123/jmld.2020-0039
- Stamm, M., & Buddeberg-Fischer, B. (2011). The impact of mentoring during postgraduate training on doctors' career success. *Medical Education*, 45(5), 488–496. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2923.2010.03857.x
- Subotnik, R. F., & Rickoff, R. (2010). Should eminence based on outstanding innovation be the goal of gifted education and talent development? Implications for policy and research. *Learning and Individual Differences*, 20(4), 358–364. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.lindif.2009.12.005
- Subotnik, R. F., Olszewski-Kubilius, P., & Worrell, F. C. (2017). The relationship between expertise and giftedness: A talent development perspective. In *The science of expertise* (pp. 427–434). Routledge.
- Toker, S., & Moseley, J. L. (2013). The mental model comparison of expert and novice performance improvement practitioners. *Performance Improvement Quarterly*, *26*(3), 7–32. https:// doi.org/10.1002/piq.21152
- Uygun-Tunç, D., & Tunç, M. N. (2023). Psychology's reform movement needs a reconceptualization of scientific expertise. *Social Psychological Bulletin*, *18*. https://doi.org/10.32872/ spb.10303
- Vygotsky, L. S., & Cole, M. (1978). *Mind in society: Development of higher psychological processes*. Harvard university press.
- Wisniewski, B., Zierer, K., & Hattie, J. (2020). The power of feedback revisited: A meta-analysis of educational feedback research. *Frontiers in Psychology*, *10*, Article 487662. https://doi. org/10.3389/fpsyg.2019.03087
- Worrell, F. C., Subotnik, R. F., & Olszewski-Kubilius, P. (2018). Talent development: A path toward eminence. *Journal of Advanced Academics*, 29(2), 139–145. https://psycnet.apa.org/ doi/10.1037/0000038-016
- Worrell, F. C., Subotnik, R. F., & Olszewski-Kubilius, P. (2021). Giftedness and eminence: Clarifying the relationship. *Gifted and Talented International*, *36*(1–2), 3–14. https://doi.org/10.10 80/15332276.2022.2049461